



2015

**Tucson-Pima County Historical Commission**  
**Plans Review Subcommittee**

**LEGAL ACTION REPORT**

**Thursday, November 12, 2015,**  
**4<sup>th</sup> Floor Conference Room, Joel D. Valdez Main Library,**  
**101 N. Stone, Tucson, Arizona 85701**

**1. Call to Order / Roll Call:**

Meeting called to session at 1:05 PM

Commissioners: Patsy Waterfall (Acting Chair), Jim Sauer, Helen Erickson, Sharon Chadwick, Michael Becherer

Staff: Glenn Moyer, Michael Taku, (PDSD), Jennifer Levstik, (OIP)

**2. Approval of Legal Action Report and Summary of Minutes of 10-22-15**

Motion by Commissioner Sauer to approve the Legal Action Report and Summary of Minutes of 10-22-15. Motion seconded by Commissioner Erickson.

Motion passed. Voice Vote 5-0.

**3. Courtesy Review Cases**

**a. Broadway Boulevard Road Improvements-Update.**

Staff was not present for any update. This item shall be rescheduled for future agenda.

**4. Historic Preservation Zone Review Cases**

**a. HPZ-15-82 – Baldyga – Proposed Windows/ Doors/Fence Changes – 826 South Jacobus Avenue (Armory Park)**

Staff Taku read into the record, the Armory Park Historic Zone Advisory Board (WUHZAB) recommendation to approve the improvements as

submitted and notes the appropriate adaptive changes to the apertures on the historic property.

The applicant/owner, Christopher Baldyga, presented the proposal for appropriate historic improvement on the property. The improvements included: replacement of aluminum vertical slider windows with wood double hung; replacement of aluminum door with wooden door with sidelights; removal and replacement of a termite infested non-historic shed with a French door; and replacement of a chain link fence with a six foot high corrugated steel fence.

It was moved by Commissioner Sauer, duly seconded by Commissioner Erickson to recommend approval of the proposed improvements as presented.

Motion carried. Voice Vote 5-0.

- b. HPZ-15-83** – McCain/Feraldi – Roof replacement: Shingles/Fiberglass-Based Asphalt Shingles [Pending Zoning Violation T15DV06389, Work performed without HPZ review/approval] – 211 South 4<sup>th</sup> Avenue (Armory Park)

Staff Taku presented this zoning violation case with the consent of the out-of-State property owners. Staff read into the record, the Armory Park Historic Zone Advisory Board (APHZAB) recommendation to approve the roof replacement and noted that the fiberglass-based asphalt singles were compatible with roofs in the historic zone. Additionally, noted that had the owners requested a formal HPZ review prior to replacement, it would have been recommended for approval.

It was moved by Commissioner Becherer, duly seconded by Commissioner Sauer to recommend approval of the roof replacement as presented.

Motion carried. Voice Vote 5-0.

- c. HPZ-15-84** – Scharf Residence – Remodel/Garage/Office/Bath/Laundry Additions – 5651 East Fort Lowell Road (Fort Lowell)

Staff Taku read into the record, the Fort Lowell Historic Zone Advisory Board (FLHZAB) recommendation to approve the revised plans with modifications as submitted.

The applicant, Tom Kirschner, Architect, presented the revised proposal as requested by FLHZAB on 11/3/15. The modifications included windows and location; roof structure; garage doors and materials; brick veneer; driveway material; paint colors; water harvesting and demolition of a termite-infested shed.

It was moved by Commissioner Chadwick, duly seconded by Commissioner Erickson, to recommend approval of the proposal consistent with FLHZAB revisions as presented.

Motion carried. Voice Vote 5-0.

**5. Historic Landmark and Signs (HL & HLS) Review Cases**

- a. "Cascade Laundry and Dry Cleaning"/"Sherwin Williams" Sign – New Design Concept – 4765 East Speedway Boulevard (Courtesy Review)

Staff Moyer presented rendering of an alternate design based on a new concept proposed by the applicant. Staff noted that because the proposed Treatment Plan for restoration failed to be approved administratively it is being forwarded to Mayor and Council (MC) for a legislative decision at a public hearing. The former proposal did not retain the majority of its character defining features, lacked sufficient historical documentation, photos and was based on applicant's inferences. Additionally, the "Cascade Laundry and Sherwin Williams" Sign appeared confusing and created a false sense of history. The alternate design "Cascade Plaza" or similar appellation reflects the current trend, creates a sense of place and maintains the diamond shape. After the Mayor and Council consideration, staff recommends the proposal be returned to PRS to determine the character defining features. The applicant, Carlos Lozano is supportive of the proposed design.

It was moved by Commissioner Sauer, duly seconded by Commissioner Erickson, to commend all those involved in crafting this solution, encourage the alternate design and look forward for the proposal to be formally reviewed by the PRS after Mayor and Council consideration, to determine the character defining features.

Motion carried. Voice Vote 5-0.

- b. **HLS-15-05** – Review for Compliance with HLS Cultural/Historic/Design Guidelines for "Riviera Motor Lodge" Proposed Historic Landmark Sign(HLS) Nomination – Treatment Plan: Restoration of a Pole Sign – 515 West Miracle Mile

Introduction of the project by staff Levistik as part of a program by City of Tucson Historic Preservation Office efforts to preserve signs working in partnership with willing owners.

According to a review by Glenn Moyer, Sign Code Administrator, the proposed Treatment Plan is in compliance with Technical Designation Guidelines.

The applicant, Jude Cook, discussed all character defining features with the Commissioners. These features included: text is RIVIERA and

MOTOR LODGE, colors, neon including horizontal stripes; shape including streamlined look; asymmetric position on the pole; flat letters "Riviera" silhouetted by exposed neon. The non-character defining features are: addition of the changeable copy portion of the sign; base of pole; pole itself and bracket on pole.

It was moved by Commissioner Sauer, duly seconded by Commissioner Erickson, to recommend approval of the Treatment Plan with the list of character defining features, including character defining text mentioned herein.

Motion carried. Voice Vote 5-0.

**6. Current Issues for Information/Discussion:**

**a. Minor Reviews**

Staff Taku and Commissioner Waterfall will conduct two minor reviews on Friday.

**b. Appeals**

None at this time.

**c. Zoning Violations**

Staff continues to assist owners on abatement of violations in the Historic Zones.

**7. Call to the Audience**

Staff Levstik updated the Subcommittee on the progress on work related to the historic Charles O. Brown House. Additionally, staff summary of the presentation to the Fort Lowell Historic Zone Advisory Board on the Adkins-Fort Lowell Parking Plan.

**8. Future Items**

A joint meeting with T-PCHC, PRS for the consideration of acceptable alternate window materials in West University Historic Zone will be on the December Agenda.

**9. Adjournment**

Meeting adjourned at 2:45 p.m.